

From: Eric Hurley <Eric.Hurley@pomona.edu>
Sent: Friday, March 26, 2010 5:43 PM
To: info@whatworks.ed.gov
Subject: ³Culture and the Interaction of Student Ethnicity with Reward Structure in Group Learning²

Greetings.

First let me say thank you to whom ever made the decision to feature my work in a brief report. I am always happy to see the word get out to practitioners.

I am writing to offer some feedback on the article as it is written because I think it mischaracterizes our findings a bit in the section: what did the authors report

It says: 'Among African-Americans, students offered a reward based on individual performance had lower scores than those offered no reward'

This language it completely misses the point by failing to mention what WAS present in the learning context in which AA students thrived.

The study is after all, an examination of what factors students find motivating in group learning. We found that AA & EA students were motivated by different things.

It should say something more like: AA students performed better in the learning context that stressed sharing and cooperation (without extrinsic reward) than in the one which stressed interpersonal competition for an extrinsic reward.

Given your mission to provide educators with tools to make informed decisions, I hope that you will be able to make appropriate changes to the document. Otherwise a teacher might be lead to for example, simply omit extrinsic reward without emphasize sharing and cooperation, which could be disastrous.

Thanks for you attention, I will wait to hear from you on this issue.

-eric

--

Eric A. Hurley, PhD.
Associate Professor
Psychology & Africana Studies
Pomona & The Claremont Colleges

909 607 1023
eric.hurley@pomona.edu

This message has been scanned by Postini anti-virus software.

From: Eric Hurley <Eric.Hurley@pomona.edu>
Sent: Friday, March 26, 2010 5:51 PM
To: info@whatworks.ed.gov
Subject: ³Culture and the Interaction of Student Ethnicity with Reward Structure in Group Learning²

Sorry, hello again.

I wanted to add to my previous email that I became aware of the issue because teacher friends of mine asked the following questions after reading the brief report.

1) What did you find to be the reason (if unknown then your opinion) as to why the African American students that were offered the reward had lower scores than those that were not offered a reward?

And

2) What does this study show? Do AA children just do poorly at math individually and as a group? Do rewards just add stress to the whole situation?

Their questions are pretty clearly shaped by the missing language about what AA children did find motivating. Also it is very significant that overall AA and EA children performed equally well. One would not get that impression from the report as written.

Thanks again. I will wait to hear from you.
-eric

On 3/26/10 2:43 PM, "Eric Hurley" <Eric.Hurley@pomona.edu> wrote:

> Greetings.
> First let me say thank you to whom ever made the decision to feature my work
> in a brief report. I am always happy to see the word get out to practitioners.
>
> I am writing to offer some feedback on the article as it is written because I
> think it mischaracterizes our findings a bit in the section: what did the
> authors report
>
> It says: 'Among African-Americans, students offered a reward based on
> individual performance had lower scores than those offered no reward'
>
> This language it completely misses the point by failing to mention what WAS
> present in the learning context in which AA students thrived.
>
> The study is after all, an examination of what factors students find
> motivating in group learning. We found that AA & EA students were motivated by
> different things.

>
> It should say something more like: AA students performed better in the
> learning context that stressed sharing and cooperation (without extrinsic
> reward) than in the one which stressed interpersonal competition for an
> extrinsic reward.
>
> Given your mission to provide educators with tools to make informed decisions,
> I hope that you will be able to make appropriate changes to the document.
> Otherwise a teacher might be lead to for example, simply omit extrinsic reward
> without emphasize sharing and cooperation, which could be disastrous.
>
>
> Thanks for you attention, I will wait to hear from you on this issue.
> -eric

--

Eric A. Hurley, PhD.
Associate Professor
Psychology & Africana Studies
Pomona & The Claremont Colleges

909 607 1023
eric.hurley@pomona.edu

This message has been scanned by Postini anti-virus software.

From: WhatWorks
Sent: Tuesday, March 30, 2010 6:29 PM
To: 'Eric.Hurley@pomona.edu'
Subject: What Works Clearinghouse (WWC 2035)
Dear Dr. Hurley,

Thank you for contacting the What Works Clearinghouse (WWC). We have received your email about the WWC Quick Review of the article " Culture and the Interaction of Student Ethnicity with Reward Structure in Group Learning." WWC staff are reviewing your email and will prepare a response.

What Works Clearinghouse

The What Works Clearinghouse was established by the U.S. Department of Education's Institute of Education Sciences to provide educators, policymakers, researchers, and the public with a central and trusted source of scientific evidence of what works in education. For more information, please visit <http://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/>.

-----Original Message-----

From: Eric Hurley [<mailto:Eric.Hurley@pomona.edu>]
Sent: Friday, March 26, 2010 5:51 PM
To: info@whatworks.ed.gov
Subject: ³Culture and the Interaction of Student Ethnicity with Reward Structure in Group Learning²

Sorry, hello again.

I wanted to add to my previous email that I became aware of the issue because teacher friends of mine asked the following questions after reading the brief report.

1) What did you find to be the reason (if unknown then your opinion) as to why the African American students that were offered the reward had lower scores than those that were not offered a reward?

And

2) What does this study show? Do AA children just do poorly at math individually and as a group? Do rewards just add stress to the whole situation?

Their questions are pretty clearly shaped by the missing language about what AA children did find motivating. Also it is very significant that overall AA and EA children performed equally well. One would not get that impression from the report as written.

Thanks again. I will wait to hear from you.
-eric

-----Original Message-----

From: Eric Hurley [<mailto:Eric.Hurley@pomona.edu>]
Sent: Friday, March 26, 2010 5:43 PM
To: info@whatworks.ed.gov
Subject: ³Culture and the Interaction of Student Ethnicity with Reward Structure in Group Learning²

Greetings.

First let me say thank you to whom ever made the decision to feature my work in a brief report. I am always happy to see the word get out to practitioners.

I am writing to offer some feedback on the article as it is written because I think it mischaracterizes our findings a bit in the section: what did the authors report

It says: 'Among African-Americans, students offered a reward based on individual performance had lower scores than those offered no reward'

This language it completely misses the point by failing to mention what WAS present in the learning context in which AA students thrived.

The study is after all, an examination of what factors students find motivating in group learning. We found that AA & EA students were motivated by different things.

It should say something more like: AA students performed better in the learning context that stressed sharing and cooperation (without extrinsic reward) than in the one which stressed interpersonal competition for an extrinsic reward.

Given your mission to provide educators with tools to make informed decisions, I hope that you will be able to make appropriate changes to the document. Otherwise a teacher might be lead to for example, simply omit extrinsic reward without emphasize sharing and cooperation, which could be disastrous.

Thanks for you attention, I will wait to hear from you on this issue.
-eric

--

Eric A. Hurley, PhD.
Associate Professor
Psychology & Africana Studies
Pomona & The Claremont Colleges

909 607 1023
eric.hurley@pomona.edu

From: What Works
Sent: Wednesday, October 13, 2010 12:24 PM
To: 'eric.hurley@pomona.edu'
Subject: What Works Clearinghouse (QR2010007)
Attachments: QR2010007.pdf

Dear Dr. Hurley,

Attached is a response to the questions you raised in your March 26 message to the What Works Clearinghouse (WWC).

Thank you,

What Works Clearinghouse

The What Works Clearinghouse was established by the U.S. Department of Education's Institute of Education Sciences to provide educators, policymakers, researchers, and the public with a central and trusted source of scientific evidence of what works in education. For more information, please visit <http://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/>.